

Wilcoxon Signed Ranks test.

KEEL non-parametric statistical module

December 15, 2011

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) | (11) | (12) | (13) | (14) | (15) | (16) | (17) | (18) | (19) | (20) | (21) | (22) | (23) | (24) | (25) | (26) | (27) | (28) | (29) | (30) | (31) | (32) | (33) | (34) | (35) | | |
|---------------------------|--------|--------|--------|-------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|-------|-------|
| Self-Training (NN) (1) | - | 565.5 | 982.0 | 546.5 | 1058.0 | 551.0 | 913.0 | 1445.5 | 504.0 | 541.5 | 948.5 | 502.5 | 902.0 | 542.0 | 710.0 | 599.5 | 873.0 | 535.5 | 534.0 | 1146.0 | 719.5 | 996.0 | 948.0 | 570.0 | 655.5 | 884.0 | 470.0 | 1416.0 | 722.0 | 994.0 | 996.0 | 1141.0 | 1072.0 | 386.0 | 735.0 | | |
| Self-Training (C45) (2) | 974.5 | - | 1202.5 | 834.0 | 1065.0 | 547.5 | 1112.0 | 772.0 | 644.0 | 842.5 | 1011.5 | 268.0 | 1065.0 | 896.5 | 807.0 | 886.5 | 1122.5 | 907.0 | 572.0 | 1394.0 | 1198.0 | 1193.5 | 1217.0 | 958.0 | 907.0 | 1125.0 | 843.0 | 1421.0 | 1256.0 | 1197.0 | 1251.0 | 1156.0 | 1156.0 | 883.0 | 914.0 | | |
| Self-Training (NB) (3) | 558.0 | 437.5 | - | 458.0 | 641.5 | 324.0 | 276.5 | 406.5 | 128.0 | 537.0 | 577.0 | 269.5 | 206.5 | 464.0 | 483.0 | 383.0 | 404.0 | 485.0 | 438.0 | 908.0 | 535.0 | 624.0 | 719.0 | 457.0 | 433.0 | 302.0 | 446.5 | 993.5 | 512.0 | 387.5 | 770.0 | 384.5 | 703.0 | 440.0 | 512.0 | | |
| Self-Training (SMO) (4) | 993.8 | 706.0 | 1082.0 | - | 1080.0 | 708.5 | 1021.0 | 569.0 | 684.0 | 940.5 | 983.5 | 667.0 | 988.0 | 753.0 | 864.0 | 835.5 | 1007.0 | 839.0 | 801.0 | 1389.0 | 836.0 | 1078.0 | 1162.0 | 909.0 | 785.0 | 1014.0 | 746.0 | 1385.0 | 832.0 | 1084.0 | 1088.5 | 1212.0 | 1100.0 | 568.5 | 1052.0 | | |
| Co-Training (NN) (5) | 482.0 | 475.0 | 898.5 | 460.0 | - | 421.0 | 826.0 | 381.5 | 413.0 | 425.0 | 616.5 | 403.0 | 824.0 | 474.0 | 622.0 | 504.0 | 809.0 | 489.0 | 466.0 | 1212.5 | 688.0 | 928.0 | 586.0 | 560.0 | 576.5 | 819.0 | 389.5 | 235.0 | 677.0 | 923.5 | 934.0 | 1049.0 | 944.0 | 316.0 | 661.5 | | |
| Co-Training (C45) (6) | 389.0 | 389.6 | 1216.0 | 881.5 | - | 1062.0 | - | 1118.5 | 706.5 | 914.0 | 954.8 | 1023.0 | 551.5 | 1076.5 | 883.0 | 392.0 | 924.0 | 1131.0 | 332.0 | 924.5 | 1366.0 | 1294.5 | 1158.0 | 1008.0 | 914.0 | 967.0 | 1130.0 | 814.0 | 1383.0 | 1238.5 | 1277.0 | 1265.5 | 1307.0 | 1143.0 | 501.5 | 890.0 | |
| Co-Training (NB) (7) | 629.0 | 428.0 | 1263.5 | 619.0 | 714.0 | 422.5 | - | 492.0 | 178.5 | 603.5 | 683.0 | 374.0 | 487.0 | 547.5 | 990.0 | 465.0 | 670.5 | 974.0 | 517.0 | 996.0 | 609.5 | 1017.5 | 814.0 | 554.0 | 574.0 | 680.5 | 531.5 | 1004.0 | 618.5 | 963.0 | 867.0 | 1143.5 | 797.5 | 631.0 | 621.0 | | |
| Co-Training (SMO) (8) | 1094.5 | 748.0 | 1143.5 | 391.0 | 1158.5 | 773.5 | 1018.0 | - | 667.5 | 1067.5 | 1111.5 | 892.0 | 1009.0 | 1004.0 | 693.5 | 968.5 | 1102.5 | 1014.0 | 785.0 | 1136.0 | 928.0 | 1128.0 | 1010.0 | 869.0 | 1049.0 | 1030.0 | 1432.0 | 1390.0 | 1183.0 | 1384.5 | 1227.0 | 1186.0 | 862.0 | 1032.0 | - | - | |
| Democratic-Cap (9) | 1030.0 | 844.0 | 1414.0 | 866.0 | 1127.0 | 869.0 | 930.5 | 817.5 | - | 1016.0 | 1085.0 | 767.0 | 1326.5 | 927.0 | 1162.5 | 1058.5 | 1350.0 | 1021.0 | 763.0 | 1413.0 | 1159.0 | 1394.5 | 1172.0 | 1022.0 | 1035.0 | 1394.0 | 883.0 | 1425.0 | 1113.0 | 1391.5 | 1229.0 | 1528.0 | 1250.0 | 581.0 | 1058.0 | | |
| SFTRFD (10) | 996.5 | 697.5 | 1003.0 | 699.5 | 686.5 | 936.5 | 472.5 | 524.0 | - | 1131.0 | 635.5 | 919.0 | 618.0 | 789.0 | 624.5 | 899.5 | 613.0 | 556.0 | 1433.0 | 713.0 | 1010.5 | 957.0 | 608.0 | 682.0 | 916.0 | 484.5 | 1450.0 | 749.0 | 1017.0 | 1008.5 | 1167.0 | 1088.5 | 438.0 | 770.0 | | | |
| IT-Training (NN) (11) | 536.5 | 528.5 | 963.0 | 499.5 | 868.5 | 517.0 | 887.0 | 313.5 | 452.0 | 454.0 | - | 459.0 | 873.5 | 513.0 | 976.0 | 537.5 | 826.0 | 522.0 | 527.5 | 1088.0 | 699.0 | 978.0 | 889.0 | 471.5 | 638.0 | 878.0 | 413.0 | 1325.5 | 688.0 | 970.0 | 943.0 | 1124.0 | 1022.0 | 1460.0 | 695.0 | | |
| IT-Training (C45) (12) | 1037.5 | 1217.0 | 1215.5 | 873.0 | 1137.0 | 933.5 | 1106.0 | 848.0 | 718.0 | 1004.5 | 1081.0 | - | 1146.0 | 941.0 | 991.0 | 1097.5 | 1192.0 | 862.5 | 626.5 | 1433.0 | 1337.5 | 1239.0 | 1238.0 | 999.0 | 1079.5 | 1186.0 | 963.0 | 1450.5 | 1254.0 | 1298.0 | 1351.0 | 1196.5 | 957.0 | 997.0 | | | |
| IT-Training (NB) (13) | 638.0 | 445.0 | 1278.5 | 642.0 | 716.0 | 442.5 | 998.0 | 601.0 | 213.5 | 621.0 | 666.5 | 394.0 | - | 564.0 | 610.0 | 528.0 | 897.0 | 617.0 | 506.0 | 1023.0 | 638.0 | 1079.0 | 821.0 | 581.0 | 586.0 | 1044.5 | 547.0 | 1027.5 | 614.0 | 1077.5 | 863.0 | 1138.5 | 828.5 | 444.5 | 677.5 | | |
| IT-Training (SMO) (14) | 943.0 | 643.5 | 1036.0 | 632.0 | 1066.0 | 657.0 | 992.5 | 481.0 | 614.0 | 522.0 | 1027.0 | 599.0 | 976.0 | - | 965.0 | 765.0 | 998.0 | 846.0 | 712.0 | 1312.0 | 841.0 | 1074.0 | 1223.5 | 859.5 | 745.0 | 967.0 | 723.0 | 1363.0 | 838.0 | 1061.5 | 1065.0 | 1123.0 | 1141.0 | 829.5 | 944.0 | | |
| DE-IT-Training (NN) (15) | 775.0 | 633.0 | 1057.0 | 576.0 | 918.0 | 608.0 | 950.0 | 546.5 | 472.5 | 751.0 | 804.0 | 1430.0 | 300.0 | 620.0 | - | 630.0 | 949.5 | 554.0 | 547.5 | 1287.0 | 813.0 | 1041.0 | 992.0 | 393.5 | 739.5 | 947.0 | 506.5 | 1295.0 | 817.0 | 1034.0 | 1045.5 | 1233.0 | 988.0 | 456.5 | 709.0 | | |
| DE-IT-Training (C45) (16) | 340.5 | 588.5 | 1177.0 | 704.5 | 1036.0 | 633.0 | 1075.0 | 633.5 | 451.5 | 915.5 | 990.5 | 387.5 | 1012.0 | 775.0 | 910.0 | 1087.0 | 1083.0 | 855.0 | 543.5 | 1304.0 | 958.0 | 1107.5 | 1107.5 | 892.0 | 847.5 | 1070.0 | 717.0 | 1396.0 | 956.0 | 1118.0 | 1152.0 | 1264.5 | 1133.0 | 802.5 | 897.5 | | |
| DE-IT-Training (NB) (17) | 667.0 | 417.5 | 1136.0 | 533.0 | 731.0 | 403.0 | 814.5 | 187.5 | 184.0 | 649.0 | 684.0 | 348.0 | 643.0 | 542.0 | 590.5 | 417.0 | 518.0 | 562.0 | 508.0 | 1303.0 | 612.5 | 969.0 | 810.0 | 544.0 | 570.0 | 765.0 | 514.0 | 995.0 | 666.0 | 801.5 | 845.0 | 1141.0 | 811.0 | 667.0 | 631.0 | | |
| DE-IT-Training (SMO) (18) | 1004.5 | 833.0 | 1055.5 | 681.0 | 1031.5 | 608.0 | 966.0 | 526.0 | 519.0 | 927.0 | 1018.0 | 557.5 | 923.0 | 694.0 | 831.0 | 685.0 | 948.0 | 692.0 | 508.0 | 1303.0 | 612.5 | 969.0 | 810.0 | 544.0 | 570.0 | 765.0 | 514.0 | 995.0 | 666.0 | 801.5 | 845.0 | 1141.0 | 811.0 | 667.0 | 631.0 | | |
| CoForest (19) | 951.0 | 968.0 | 1102.0 | 739.0 | 1074.0 | 918.5 | 1023.0 | 755.0 | 777.0 | 929.0 | 1012.5 | 913.5 | 1034.0 | 825.0 | 837.5 | 996.5 | 1032.0 | 947.5 | - | 1244.0 | 1046.0 | 1091.0 | 1071.5 | 1062.0 | 973.0 | 1042.5 | 768.0 | 1245.0 | 1043.0 | 1068.0 | 1102.5 | 1305.0 | 1018.0 | 910.0 | 1129.5 | | |
| Racco (NN) (20) | 80.0 | 146.0 | 604.0 | 181.0 | 292.5 | 166.0 | 444.0 | 104.0 | 126.0 | 326.0 | 192.0 | 109.0 | 317.0 | 168.0 | 285.0 | 131.0 | 309.0 | 296.0 | - | 209.0 | 616.0 | 344.0 | 236.0 | 288.0 | 356.0 | 130.0 | 89.0 | 618.0 | 40.0 | 322.0 | 784.0 | 416.0 | 843.0 | 381.0 | - | | |
| Racco (C45) (21) | 820.5 | 287.0 | 1005.0 | 704.0 | 832.0 | 282.5 | 875.5 | 612.0 | 435.0 | 770.0 | 841.0 | 202.5 | 905.0 | 699.0 | 729.0 | 692.0 | 903.5 | 694.0 | 494.0 | 1278.0 | 605.0 | 971.0 | 1075.5 | 799.5 | 598.5 | 903.5 | 661.0 | 1324.0 | 777.0 | 974.0 | 1124.0 | 1062.0 | 982.0 | 696.5 | 772.0 | | |
| Racco (NB) (22) | 344.0 | 346.5 | 916.0 | 385.0 | 617.0 | 342.0 | 322.5 | 411.0 | 145.5 | 529.5 | 362.0 | 391.0 | 486.0 | 466.0 | 493.0 | 374.5 | 431.0 | 485.0 | 448.0 | 924.0 | 569.0 | 697.0 | 787.0 | 458.5 | 475.0 | 464.0 | 463.0 | 884.0 | 533.0 | 666.0 | 780.0 | 681.0 | 747.0 | 440.0 | 560.0 | | |
| Racco (SMO) (23) | 399.0 | 393.0 | 821.0 | 388.0 | 654.0 | 338.0 | 496.0 | 369.5 | 380.0 | 382.5 | 600.0 | 382.0 | 419.0 | 318.5 | 448.0 | 432.5 | 490.0 | 468.5 | 1196.0 | 464.5 | 801.0 | 648.0 | 386.0 | 491.5 | 381.0 | 313.0 | 698.0 | 491.0 | 811.0 | 311.0 | 688.0 | 491.0 | 801.0 | 680.0 | 680.0 | | |
| Co-Bagging (NN) (24) | 970.0 | 582.0 | 1083.0 | 601.0 | 1040.0 | 569.0 | 986.0 | 530.0 | 463.0 | 877.0 | 1068.5 | 486.0 | 958.5 | 625.5 | 881.5 | 593.0 | 831.0 | 598.5 | 538.0 | 1114.0 | 760.5 | 1064.0 | 1064.0 | 386.0 | 491.5 | 811.0 | 518.0 | 1434.0 | 742.0 | 1032.0 | 1063.0 | 1261.0 | 1062.0 | 529.5 | 709.5 | | |
| Co-Bagging (C45) (25) | 884.5 | 635.0 | 1108.0 | 751.0 | 963.5 | 580.0 | 969.0 | 671.0 | 495.0 | 858.0 | 902.0 | 405.5 | 954.0 | 795.0 | 754.5 | 692.5 | 970.0 | 722.5 | 567.0 | 1237.0 | 941.5 | 1065.0 | 993.5 | 825.5 | - | 963.0 | 752.5 | 1233.5 | 931.0 | 1069.0 | 1078.5 | 1221.5 | 1046.0 | 793.0 | 830.0 | | |
| Co-Bagging (NB) (26) | 646.0 | 415.0 | 1283.0 | 526.0 | 721.0 | 410.0 | 818.5 | 491.0 | 176.0 | 624.0 | 662.0 | 384.0 | 449.5 | 553.0 | 583.0 | 470.0 | 776.5 | 588.5 | 497.5 | 1010.0 | 638.5 | 1021.0 | 869.0 | 578.5 | 577.0 | - | 528.0 | 1008.0 | 607.0 | 881.0 | 859.0 | 1134.0 | 807.0 | 537.0 | 642.5 | | |
| Co-Bagging (SMO) (27) | 1070.0 | 697.0 | 1063.5 | 804.0 | 1140.5 | 1008.5 | 1460.0 | 639.0 | 1000.5 | 1127.0 | 637.0 | 983.0 | 843.0 | 1006.0 | 919.0 | 823.0 | 1006.0 | 772.0 | 740.0 | 1101.0 | 899.0 | 1079.0 | 1022.0 | 787.5 | 1012.0 | - | 840.0 | 1022.0 | 809.5 | 1108.0 | 1114.0 | 933.0 | 989.5 | - | - | | |
| Rel-Racco (NN) (28) | 69.0 | 119.0 | 634.5 | 185.0 | 250.0 | 122.0 | 536.0 | 108.0 | 116.0 | 35.0 | 159.5 | 87.0 | 512.5 | 177.0 | 245.0 | 175.0 | 545.0 | 388.0 | 295.0 | 883.0 | 246.0 | 591.0 | 334.0 | 106.0 | 251.5 | 532.0 | 139.0 | - | 215.0 | 618.0 | 432.5 | 775.5 | 612.0 | 49.0 | 375.0 | | |
| Rel-Racco (C45) (29) | 818.0 | 284.0 | 1058.0 | 688.0 | 883.0 | 294.5 | 921.5 | 610.0 | 324.0 | 891.0 | 824.0 | 116.5 | 956.0 | 644.0 | 623.0 | 684.0 | 834.0 | 384.0 | 693.0 | 496.0 | 1241.5 | 633.0 | 1059.0 | 1039.0 | 443.0 | 669.0 | 633.0 | 683.0 | 1826.0 | 1088.0 | 607.0 | 881.0 | 859.0 | 1134.0 | 807.0 | 537.0 | 642.5 |
| Rel-Racco (NB) (30) | 546.0 | 343.0 | 897.5 | 456.0 | 616.5 | 333.0 | 522.0 | 407.0 | 148.5 | 523.0 | 570.0 | 286.0 | 462.5 | 476.5 | 506.0 | 422.0 | 638.5 | 604.0 | 442.0 | 923.0 | 516.0 | 825.0 | 728.0 | 463.0 | 471.0 | 559.0 | 453.0 | 922.0 | 532.0 | - | 777.0 | 997.5 | 676.0 | 446.0 | 559.5 | | |
| Rel-Racco (SMO) (31) | 344.0 | 289.0 | 770.0 | 271.5 | 606.0 | 289.5 | 674.0 | 175.5 | 283.0 | 331.5 | 397.0 | 242.0 | 677.0 | 235.0 | 390.5 | 388.0 | 695.0 | 963.0 | 437.5 | 1108.0 | 416.0 | 760.0 | 551.5 | 477.0 | 401.5 | 681.0 | 232.5 | 1107.5 | 439.5 | 763.0 | - | 929.0 | 784.5 | 612.0 | 528.0 | | |
| APCC (32) | 399.0 | 246.0 | 916.5 | 328.0 | 671.0 | 233.0 | 396.5 | 313.0 | 112.0 | 319.0 | 416.0 | 209.0 | 911.5 | 362.0 | 307.0 | 230.5 | 399.0 | 321.0 | 235.0 | 976.0 | 448.0 | 359.0 | 667.0 | 310.0 | 318.5 | 886.0 | 342.0 | 954.5 | 340.5 | 542.5 | 611.0 | - | 498.0 | 428.5 | 253.0 | | |
| APSSC (33) | 466 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) | (11) | (12) | (13) | (14) | (15) | (16) | (17) | (18) | (19) | (20) | (21) | (22) | (23) | (24) | (25) | (26) | (27) | (28) | (29) | (30) | (31) | (32) | (33) | (34) | (35) | | |
|---------------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|---|---|
| Self-Training (NN) (1) | - | o | • | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | | |
| Self-Training (C45) (2) | - | o | • | o | • | o | • | o | o | o | • | o | • | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | | |
| Self-Training (NB) (3) | o | - | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | | |
| Self-Training (SMO) (4) | o | o | • | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| Co-Training (NN) (5) | o | o | • | o | - | o | o | o | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| Co-Training (C45) (6) | o | o | • | o | • | - | o | o | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| Co-Training (NB) (7) | o | o | • | o | o | - | o | o | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| Co-Training (SMO) (8) | • | • | • | • | • | • | - | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | |
| Democratic-Co (9) | • | • | • | • | • | • | - | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | |
| SETRFD (10) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| TriTraining (NN) (11) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| TriTraining (C45) (12) | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | - | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • |
| TriTraining (NB) (13) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | - | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| TriTraining (SMO) (14) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | - | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| DE-TriTraining (NN) (15) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | - | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| DE-TriTraining (C45) (16) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| DE-TriTraining (NB) (17) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | • | |
| DE-TriTraining (SMO) (18) | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • |
| CoForest (19) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Rasco (NN) (20) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Rasco (C45) (21) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Rasco (NB) (22) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Rasco (SMO) (23) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Co-Bagging (NN) (24) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Co-Bagging (C45) (25) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Co-Bagging (NB) (26) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Co-Bagging (SMO) (27) | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • |
| Rel-Rasco (NN) (28) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Rel-Rasco (C45) (29) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Rel-Rasco (NB) (30) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| Rel-Rasco (SMO) (31) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| CLCC (32) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| APSSC (33) | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |
| SNRCE (34) | • | • | • | • | • | • | o | o | o | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • | • |
| ADE-CoForest (35) | o | o | • | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | o | |

Table 2: Summary of the Wilcoxon test. •= the method in the row improves the method of the column. o= the method in the column improves the method of the row. Upper diagonal of level significance $\alpha = 0.9$, Lower diagonal level of significance $\alpha = 0.95$

| Method | $\alpha = 0.9$ | | $\alpha = 0.95$ | |
|----------------------|----------------|----|-----------------|----|
| | + | ± | + | ± |
| Self-Training (NN) | 10 | 21 | 5 | 28 |
| Self-Training (C45) | 18 | 31 | 17 | 33 |
| Self-Training (NB) | 0 | 10 | 0 | 12 |
| Self-Training (SMO) | 17 | 33 | 15 | 34 |
| Co-Training (NN) | 3 | 19 | 3 | 19 |
| Co-Training (C45) | 21 | 33 | 17 | 34 |
| Co-Training (NB) | 6 | 19 | 4 | 23 |
| Co-Training (SMO) | 24 | 34 | 22 | 34 |
| Democratic-Co | 26 | 34 | 25 | 34 |
| SETRED | 11 | 29 | 9 | 29 |
| TriTraining (NN) | 6 | 19 | 4 | 21 |
| TriTraining (C45) | 27 | 34 | 23 | 34 |
| TriTraining (NB) | 8 | 23 | 8 | 27 |
| TriTraining (SMO) | 16 | 33 | 11 | 33 |
| DE-TriTraining (NN) | 9 | 28 | 8 | 32 |
| DE-TriTraining (C45) | 15 | 30 | 14 | 32 |
| DE-TriTraining (NB) | 4 | 22 | 2 | 25 |
| DE-TriTraining (SMO) | 13 | 31 | 12 | 32 |
| CoForest | 24 | 34 | 18 | 34 |
| Rasco (NN) | 0 | 6 | 0 | 8 |
| Rasco (C45) | 9 | 29 | 7 | 29 |
| Rasco (NB) | 1 | 10 | 0 | 14 |
| Rasco (SMO) | 4 | 17 | 2 | 18 |
| Co-Bagging (NN) | 14 | 27 | 11 | 30 |
| Co-Bagging (C45) | 11 | 31 | 9 | 32 |
| Co-Bagging (NB) | 6 | 21 | 5 | 23 |
| Co-Bagging (SMO) | 20 | 33 | 18 | 33 |
| Rel-Rasco (NN) | 0 | 6 | 0 | 7 |
| Rel-Rasco (C45) | 9 | 29 | 9 | 29 |
| Rel-Rasco (NB) | 1 | 10 | 0 | 16 |
| Rel-Rasco (SMO) | 2 | 14 | 2 | 16 |
| CLCC | 0 | 4 | 0 | 7 |
| APSSC | 1 | 14 | 1 | 14 |
| SNNRCE | 19 | 33 | 16 | 34 |
| ADE-CoForest | 6 | 28 | 4 | 29 |

Table 3: Wilcoxon test summary results